

**MINUTES**  
**Design Review Board**  
**February 5, 2020, at 5:30 PM**  
**City Council Chambers, 915 S. Tovreaville Road,**  
**Bisbee, Arizona 85603**

**The Meeting Called to Order by FRANK DAVIS at 5:30PM**

**Roll Call-Board Members**

<b>Design Review Board</b>	Present	Absent	Excused
Peter Gaffer	X		
Stephan Green	X		
<b>Yvette Ponte</b>	X		
Frank Davis, Chair	X		
Jon Sky	X		
Ben Lepley, Vice Chair	X		
Shawn DeCraemer	X		
Leslie Johns, City Council Liaison			X

**Staff: James Ledbetter, City Attorney, Theresa Coleman/DRB Staff Liaison**

The staff would like to inform all applicants

1. That all applications on this DRB agenda will require a building permit or a sign permit.
2. That Design Review Board approval does not necessarily reflect the views and policies of the State Historic Preservation Office, which controls decisions impacting tax status of designated contributing historic properties. Please review SHPO's policies. If necessary, contact them directly before making any exterior changes to your property.

The intent of the Design Review process as applied within the Bisbee Historic District is to:

- A. Improve and encourage uses leading to the conservation and/or rehabilitation of buildings, structures, sites, objects and spaces within the Historic District, while allowing for a vibrant, creative and livable community.
- B. Encourage harmonious growth and orderly development.
- C. Assure that future setting, design and construction will correspond to and enhance the visual characteristics of the district.
- D. Prevent construction, alteration or remodeling from occurring in a manner that would be detrimental to the historical or visual characteristics of the district.

**CALL TO THE PUBLIC:** Residents of the City of Bisbee may speak at this time regarding Design Review Board topics that **ARE NOT ON THE AGENDA**

(Please note that the public may address the Board regarding individual items on this agenda following the applicant's initial presentation of their agenda item)

- Lowell Braxton, representing Bisbee Partners LLC spoke regarding 805 Tombstone Canyon gave a brief history and also, gave their concerns regarding this property.
- Doris Turner, spoke regarding 805 Tombstone Canyon.

**OLD BUSINESS**

**NEW BUSINESS**

**Agenda Item 1**

Discussion and Possible Pre-Approval of material choices for replacing the roof on the Covenant Presbytery Church, before applying for grants for the Covenant Presbytery Church located at 19 Howell Avenue #Bi-160- Significant Structure it was built 1903-04.

**Mr. Ken Budge, representatives of the Covenant Presbytery Church spoke regarding the pre-approval of material choices for replacing the roof and answered questions from the Board.**

**MOTION: Mr. Davis moved to approve that the Covenant Presbytery Church keep the design of the shingle that is on there now and when they get their money come back to the board to talk about color.**

**SECOND: Mr. DeCraemer**

**MOTION PASSED: UNANIMOUSLY**

**Agenda Item 2.**

Application 19-75 Bisbee Residential Historic District, Non-Contributing Property #293 located at 625 Tombstone Canyon, Applicant Leslie York/ Representative: Brian Hope

This application is seeking approval for a conversion of carport to garage Installation of therapeutic resistance pool. Replacement of aluminum contractor-grade windows with energy efficient models. Installation of double glazed French door with operable sidelites. Screening of existing covered porch.

Pursuant to Bisbee Zoning Code Article 3.5.2.A, the property owner is required to obtain approval from the DRB prior to the change of any building's exterior features.

**A Representative for 625 Tombstone Canyon spoke regarding this application to the Board and answered questions regarding the materials.**

**MOTION: Mr. Sky moved to approve DRB Application 19-75 as submitted.**

**SECOND: Mr. Gaffer**

**MOTION PASSED: 6/1 (Ponte)**

**Agenda Item 3.**

Application 19-76 Bisbee Residential Historic District, Contributing Property #435 located at 216 B Opera Drive, Applicant Maira Asaro/ Representative: Self and/or Johnny Rabey, Contractor

This application is seeking approval for:

1. Correction/modification of roof on bedroom addition on northeast side of house from 2011 (DRB-approved design. Current roof does not match original design and is non-conforming. New design extends from house roof and maintains architectural integrity of house roof lines and porch roof lines
2. Addition of clerestory windows under new roof correction

3. Replace windows, southeast face, with double hung, adding fixed transom windows above
4. Add fixed transom window above entry door, East Face
5. Rebuild deck after retaining wall is rebuilt following previous footprint (deck had to be removed due to failing wall), with the addition of a roof over the new deck
6. South face, between French doors and bay window: Double hung window to match existing, with transom window above
7. Add fixed transom windows, above French doors

Pursuant to Bisbee Zoning Code Article 3.5.2.A, the property owner is required to obtain approval from the DRB prior to the change of any building's exterior features.

**Ms. Asaro spoke regarding her application to the Board and answered questions regarding the materials and scope of work.**

**Mr. Davis, Chair encouraged Ms. Asaro to contact SHPO before doing the windows to see what they say regarding since it was a contributing structure.**

**MOTION: Mr. Sky moved to approve DRB Application 19-76 as submitted.**

**SECOND: Mr. Davis                      MOTION PASSED: UNANIMOUSLY**

**Agenda Item 4.**

Application 19-77 Bisbee Residential Historic District, Non-Contributing Property #476 located at 348 Williams Avenue, Applicant EJT Trust –James PF Terry Trustee of EJT Trust

This application is seeking approval for demolition of entire existing condemned house located at 348 Williams Avenue (one house –two lots).

The 300ft. Notification went out on January 6, 2020.

At the time this Agenda was put together we had not received comments regarding the proposed.

Pursuant to Bisbee's Zoning Code Article 3.5.5, the property owner is required to obtain approval from the DRB prior to all demolitions. All notification required by 3.5.2.G.2 have been completed.

Per 3.5.5 the DRB is required to determine if preservation of the structure is physically and/or economically feasible and to what extent the proposed demolition effects the structure in question or any contributing structure within the Historic District.

Zoning Code Excerpt, 3.5.5 Demolition and Movement of Historic Buildings The Design Review Board must approve all demolition permits and relocation permits for any significant part of any building in the Historic Preservation (HP) Overlay District. No permit shall be issued by the Building Inspector until DRB approval. In making its' decision, the Design Review Board should determine whether and to what extent demolition or movement affects the structure in question or any contributing structure within the district as demolition and/or movement can have significant impact on the City in general. For permit approval the applicant must show that preserving the building is not physically and/or economically feasible.

A. Approval: The Design Review Board may recommend approval of the demolition or relocation permit if any of the following conditions exist:

1. The structure is judged by the Building Inspector to be a hazard to public safety.
2. It is demonstrated that the structure is a deterrent to a major improvement program which will be of substantial community benefit
3. Retention of the structure would cause undue financial hardship on the owner, which would be defined as a situation where the investment required to preserve or rehabilitate the structure could not be offset by the return on the property.
4. The Design Review Board shall notify the Building Official that the demolition permit is approved. The Building Official may do the following:
  - a. Issue the permit, or,
  - b. Deny the permit based on other duly adopted and applicable ordinances or regulations.

B. Denial: If preservation or rehabilitation is determined to be feasible, and if the structure has been designated as one having special significance or as a contributing property within the District, the Design Review Board shall deny the permit for demolition or movement of a structure.

**Mr. Terry spoke regarding his application to the Board and answered questions regarding.**

**The Board discussed this application with the applicant at length. The listed items below were included in the discussion.**

- **Reuse materials**
- **Using the same footprint**
- **Going before the Planning and Zoning Commission**
- **Come back with a plan for replacement of structure (not enough information at this time)**

**MOTION: Mr. Sky moved to table DRB Application 19-77.**

**SECOND: Mr. DeCraemer**

**Mr. Davis, Chair commented that we have a gentleman here that wanted to take care of this, we have a lot of derelict properties that we are trying to get cleaned up.**

**MOTION PASSED: UNANIMOUSLY**

**Agenda Item 5.**

Application 20-02 Bisbee Residential Historic District, Contributing Property #316 located at 31 Moon Canyon, Applicant Douglas & Georgia Kellough

This application is seeking approval to remove old fractured concrete roof- repair retaining walls re-build roof with joists- corrugated metal- re-install wooden patio deck over, re install door. Façade will essentially be unchanged but garage will be useable.

Theresa Coleman, City Manager approved administratively on 1/6/2020, but once the building inspector reviewed application the administrative approval was rescinded. (Extending the length will need to go before Design Review Board).

Pursuant to Bisbee Zoning Code Article 3.5.2.A, the property owner is required to obtain approval from the DRB prior to the change of any building's exterior features.

**Mr. Kellough spoke regarding his application to the Board and answered questions regarding.**

**MOTION: Mr. Gaffer moved to approve agenda item 5 Application 20-02 as submitted.  
SECOND: Mr. Lepley      MOTION PASSED: UNANIMOUSLY**

**Agenda Item 6.**

Application 20-03 Bisbee Residential Historic District, Contributing Property #535 located at 203A Tombstone Canyon, Applicant Collin Neil Lacy

This application is seeking approval for an addition of front deck and safety railing to house. Deck would run the complete length of the house-38' and be 8" wide. Deck would be made from pressure treated wood structure with brown composite decking, because of the slope of the hill the deck would sit about 1.5' above the ground at the front. They would also be building a security railing that extends beyond the deck all the way to the stairs on the left hand side., The Security railing would match the deck rail, and while it was modeled out as a simple capped picket style and they are asking the Design Review Board to share their thoughts on a style that they would be ok with.

Pursuant to Bisbee Zoning Code Article 3.5.2.A, the property owner is required to obtain approval from the DRB prior to the change of any building's exterior features.

**Mr. Sullivan, representative for 203 A Tombstone Canyon spoke regarding this application to the Board and answered questions regarding.**

**MOTION: Ms. Ponte moved to approve Application 20-02.  
SECOND: Mr. DeCraemer      MOTION PASSED: UNANIMOUSLY**

**Agenda Item 7.**

Application 20-04 Bisbee Residential Historic District, Contributing Property #671 located at 201 B Quality Hill (201 B Ledge Avenue), Applicant Michael & Melinda Ribaud/Representative: Home Depot

This application is seeking approval to install 5 retrofit windows – white interior, bronze exterior.

The Property Owner has asked that they be called during the meeting regarding this application they have already winterized their home and are not in town.

Pursuant to Bisbee Zoning Code Article 3.5.2.A, the property owner is required to obtain approval from the DRB prior to the change of any building's exterior features.

**Melinda & Michael Ribaud attended meeting via phone. They spoke regarding their application to the Board and answered questions regarding.**

**The applicants acknowledged that the proposed windows did not meet the design guidelines and asking that the Board deny this application so they could reapply.**

**MOTION: Mr. DeCraemer moved to deny DRB Application 20-04.  
SECOND: Mr. Lepley      MOTION PASSED: 6/1 (Sky)**

**Agenda Item 8.**

Application 20-06 Bisbee Residential Historic District, Contributing Property #757 located at 98 B Quality Hill, Applicant Yvette Ponte

This application is seeking approval to replace failing windows which are leaking, allowing condensation to penetrate into house. Replace trim exact as existing.

Pursuant to Bisbee Zoning Code Article 3.5.2.A, the property owner is required to obtain approval from the DRB prior to the change of any building's exterior features.

**Ms. Ponte spoke regarding her application to the Board and answered questions regarding.**

**This application was for retro-approval for work that has already been done. She apologized to the Board for not bringing this to them. The trim will be like for like on the exterior.**

**MOTION: Mr. Lepley moved to approve application 20-06.**

**SECOND: Mr. DeCraemer**

**MOTION PASSED: 5/1 (Sky)**

**Agenda Item 9.**

Application 20-08 Bisbee Residential Historic District, Non-Contributing Property #677 located at 183 Quality Hill (183 Cross), Applicant Richard Brandmahl

This application is seeking approval re-build deck in backyard like for like.

Pursuant to Bisbee Zoning Code Article 3.5.2.A, the property owner is required to obtain approval from the DRB prior to the change of any building's exterior features.

**Mr. Bradberry, representative of 183 Quality Hill (183 Cross) spoke regarding this application to the Board and answered questions regarding.**

**MOTION: Mr. Lepley moved to approve Application 20-08 to use vertical 2x2 4" wood.**

**SECOND: Mr. Gaffer**

**MOTION PASSED: UNANIMOUSLY**

**Agenda Item 10.**

Application 20-10 Bisbee Historic District, Contributing Bisbee Commercial Historic District located at 67 Main Street, Applicant: Two Partners Inc

This application is seeking approval for a new sign.

Pursuant to Bisbee Zoning Code Article 7.5, the property owner is requested to obtain approval from the DRB prior to obtaining a sign permit for installation of commercial signage

**Mr. Lewis spoke regarding his application to the Board and answered questions regarding.**



- Administrative Approval was given by Theresa Coleman, City Manager on 1/2/2020 Application 20-01; 218 A Ok Street #1087 Contributing- Repair retaining wall using gabion baskets.
- Administrative Approval was given by Theresa Coleman, City Manager on 1/15/2020 Application 19-74; 406 Garden Avenue #247 Contributing- Back window wood two over two and front right window wood two over two.
- Administrative Approval was given by Theresa Coleman, City Manager on 1/6/2020 Application 20-05; 98 B Quality Hill Road #757 Contributing- Retaining Wall Gabion Baskets as presented.
- Administrative Approval was given by Theresa Coleman, City Manager on 1/10/2020 Application 20-07; 138 Opera Drive #425 Non-contributing- Retaining Wall finish to match others in Opera area.
- Administrative Approval was given by Theresa Coleman, City Manager on 1/27/2020 Application 20-13; 433 Garden Avenue #259 Contributing- Exposed rock and mortar to be the same as existing façade.
- Administrative Approval was given by Theresa Coleman, City Manager on 1/28/2020 Application 20-09; 743 Tombstone Canyon #233 Non-contributing- Match existing fencing and railing.

**FUTURE AGENDA ITEM SUGGESTIONS** (Board members may suggest topics for future meeting agendas, but Board will not here discuss, deliberate or take any action on these topics.)

- Discuss return of paper copies (packets to Board members)
- Discuss Zoning Code
- Discuss creating awareness

**Adjournment: 7:20PM**

**MOTION: Mr. Davis moved to adjourn**

**SECOND: Mr. Green**

**MOTION PASSED: UNANIMOUSLY**