

MINUTES
Design Review Board
March 4, 2020, at 5:30 PM
City Council Chambers, 915 S. Tovreaville Road,
Bisbee, Arizona 85603

The Meeting Called to Order by FRANK DAVIS at 5:30PM

Roll Call-Board Members

Design Review Board	Present	Absent	Excused
Peter Gaffer	X		
Stephan Green	X		
Yvette Ponte	X		
Frank Davis, Chair	X		
Ben Lepley, Vice Chair	X		
Shawn DeCraemer	X		
VACANT			
Leslie Johns, City Council Liaison			X

Staff: James Ledbetter, City Attorney, Theresa Coleman/DRB Staff Liaison

The staff would like to inform all applicants

- 1. That all applications on this DRB agenda will require a building permit or a sign permit.**
- 2. That Design Review Board approval does not necessarily reflect the views and policies of the State Historic Preservation Office, which controls decisions impacting tax status of designated contributing historic properties. Please review SHPO’s polices. If necessary, contact them directly before making any exterior changes to your property.**

The intent of the Design Review process as applied within the Bisbee Historic District is to:

- A. Improve and encourage uses leading to the conservation and/or rehabilitation of buildings, structures, sites, objects and spaces within the Historic District, while allowing for a vibrant, creative and livable community.**
- B. Encourage harmonious growth and orderly development.**
- C. Assure that future setting, design and construction will correspond to and enhance the visual characteristics of the district.**
- D. Prevent construction, alteration or remodeling from occurring in a manner that would be detrimental to the historical or visual characteristics of the district.**

CALL TO THE PUBLIC: *Residents* of the City of Bisbee may speak at this time regarding Design Review Board topics that **ARE NOT ON THE AGENDA**

(Please note that the public may address the Board regarding individual items on this agenda following the applicant’s initial presentation of their agenda item)

OLD BUSINESS

NEW BUSINESS

Agenda Item 1.

Application 20-11 Bisbee Residential Historic District, Non-Contributing Property #344 located at 404 B Mason Hill, Applicant Carolyn Harris / Representative Dottie Watson

This application is seeking approval for roof mount solar panels (12).

The 300ft. Notification went out on February 4, 2020.

At the time this Agenda was put together we had not received comments regarding the proposed.

Pursuant to Bisbee Zoning Code Article 3.5.2.A, the property owner is required to obtain approval from the DRB prior to the change of any building's exterior features.

Ms. Carolyn Harris spoke regarding her application to the Board and answered questions regarding.

MOTION: Mr. DeCraemer moved to approve DRB application 20-11 with the understanding that the panels are parallel to the current roof line.

SECOND: Mr. Lepley

MOTION PASSED: UNANIMOUSLY

Agenda Item 2.

Application 20-12 Bisbee Residential Historic District, Non-Contributing Property #896 located at 606 A Tombstone Canyon, Applicants Justin Piper/ Nicole Hansen

This application is seeking approval to build a glass greenhouse attached to the SE side of their house with native stone foundation, reclaimed wood framed windows, 2 door to the exterior and a poly-carbonate roof,. The angels and dimensions will match the design of the house.

The 300ft. Notification went out on February 4, 2020.

At the time this Agenda was put together we had not received comments regarding the proposed.

Pursuant to Bisbee Zoning Code Article 3.5.2.A, the property owner is required to obtain approval from the DRB prior to the change of any building's exterior features.

Mr. Justin Pippet spoke regarding his application to the Board and answered questions regarding.

MOTION: Mr. Davis moved to approve as submitted.

SECOND: Ms. Ponte

MOTION PASSED: UNANIMOUSLY

Agenda Item 3.

Application 20-16 Bisbee Historic District, Contributing Property Bi-135 located at 16 Clawson Avenue, Applicant: Britt Hanson

Zoning R-1, Setbacks F=10 S=5 R=10 Accessory =3

This application is seeking to renovate the home to include:

1. Demolition of Hazardous Tower
2. Removal of Non-Code Compliant Elements with Replacement in kind
3. Replacement of outdated windows and doors with energy efficient models

October 3, 2018 this item was heard before the Board- The Motion was to table it to a future date passed Unanimously.

November 7, 2018 this item was brought back to the Board- The Motion was to table and return with two (2) proposals passed Unanimously.

When this was heard both on October 3rd and November 7th there were two (2) letters the Board received not in favor of this application and eight (8) letters the Board received in favor of this application.

There was also a letter that indicated that the restoration would be much too costly at this stage and that demolition and rebuilding a new residence with a plan to match the existing structure, in the same or smaller footprint, would be a much better route to take.

The 300ft. Notification went out on February 13, 2020.

At the time this Agenda was put together we had not received comments regarding the proposed.

Pursuant to Bisbee Zoning Code Article 3.5.2.A, the property owner is required to obtain approval from the DRB prior to the change of any building's exterior features.

Pursuant to Bisbee's Zoning Code Article 3.5.5, the property owner is required to obtain approval from the DRB prior to all demolitions. All notification required by 3.5.2.G.2 have been completed.

Per 3.5.5 the DRB is required to determine if preservation of the structure is physically and/or economically feasible and to what extent the proposed demolition effects the structure in question or any contributing structure within the Historic District.

Zoning Code Excerpt, 3.5.5 Demolition and Movement of Historic Buildings The Design Review Board must approve all demolition permits and relocation permits for any significant part of any building in the Historic Preservation (HP) Overlay District. No permit shall be issued by the Building Inspector until DRB approval. In making its' decision, the Design Review Board should determine whether and to what extent demolition or movement affects the structure in question or any contributing structure within the district as demolition and/or movement can have significant impact on the City in general. For permit approval the applicant must show that preserving the building is not physically and/or economically feasible.

A. Approval: The Design Review Board may recommend approval of the demolition or relocation permit if any of the following conditions exist:

1. The structure is judged by the Building Inspector to be a hazard to public safety.
2. It is demonstrated that the structure is a deterrent to a major improvement program which will be of substantial community benefit
3. Retention of the structure would cause undue financial hardship on the owner, which would be defined as a situation where the investment required to preserve or rehabilitate the structure could not be offset by the return on the property.
4. The Design Review Board shall notify the Building Official that the demolition permit is approved. The Building Official may do the following:
 - a. Issue the permit, or,
 - b. Deny the permit based on other duly adopted and applicable ordinances or regulations.

B. Denial: If preservation or rehabilitation is determined to be feasible, and if the structure has been designated as one having special significance or as a contributing property within the District, the Design Review Board shall deny the permit for demolition or movement of a structure.

Mr. Britt Hanson spoke regarding his application to the Board and answered questions regarding the house, materials and scope of work.

- **Bill Bailey spoke in support of Mr. Hanson**
- **Steve Trahan spoke in support of Mr. Hanson**
- **Rick Rhodehamel spoke in support of Mr. Hanson**

Mr. DeCraemer would like to see an alternate proposal to save the existing home. Mr. Hanson stated that he was not going to do that.

- **John Charley spoke in support of Mr. Hanson**

Ms. Coleman clarified the minutes regarding Mr. Hanson's DRB application 18-57 that were approved minutes of the Design Review Board for October 3, 2018 and November 7, 2018.

- **Jon Sky spoke in opposition of Mr. Hanson**
- **Tom Slusser spoke regarding getting a structural engineer if the Design Review Board wanted to save this house**
- **Michael McPartlin spoke regarding the notice that was sent out for 16 Clawson not being correct, it should be redone**

Mr. Davis, chair of the Design Review Board asked that Joe Ward, Bldg. Inspector speak regarding this application.

Mr. Ward stated that this was a contributing structure. He said that in his professional opinion that it was inappropriate to demolish the house. He also said that the design was taking it from historic to modern. He also said that it was feasible to fix the house. It can and should be preserved.

Mr. Hanson said that with enough money you can do anything you wanted, you can't force a restoration of a house. The question was not whether it could be done the question was whether or not it could be done at a price that was feasible.

Mr. Davis said that we do want to save these old buildings, but if we don't do something with it now the building was just going to sit there. Mr. Davis said that Mr. Hanson should put in a new application regarding 16 Clawson Avenue.

MOTION: Mr. Davis moved to deny this application as it is presented.

SECOND: Mr. DeCraemer

MOTION PASSED: UNANIMOUSLY

Agenda Item 4.

Application 20-18 Bisbee Residential Historic District, Copper Queen Library (S) Bi-34 built in 1906 located at 6 Main Street, Applicant City of Bisbee

This application is seeking approval for a mounted cast aluminum sign, 18"x32" inches commemorating Women's Suffrage this will be affixed to building on corner outside of post office.

Pursuant to Bisbee Zoning Code Article 7.5, the property owner is requested to obtain approval from the DRB prior to obtaining a sign permit for installation of signage.

Mr. Jason Macoviak, Library Manager spoke regarding the City of Bisbee application for the Copper Queen Library to the Board.

MOTION: Mr. Gaffer moved to approve application 20-18 as presented.

SECOND: Mr. DeCraemer

MOTION PASSED: UNANIMOUSLY

Agenda Item 5.

Application 20-19 Bisbee Residential Historic District, Contributing Property #115 located at 104 B Taylor Avenue, Applicant Philip Garrubba

This application is seeking retro-active approval for two (2) bedroom windows that needed to be replaced. They are the same style of windows as the old ones.

Mr. Garrubba was unaware that the replacement of windows needed to go before the Board and apologizes to the Board for this misstep. Going forward he understands that all exterior, windows, and roof etc. needs to go before the Board.

The Property Owner has asked that they be called during the meeting regarding this application they have already winterized their home and are not in town.

Pursuant to Bisbee Zoning Code Article 3.5.2.A, the property owner is required to obtain approval from the DRB prior to the change of any building's exterior features.

Ms. Elsa Torres, Home Depot (the installer) spoke regarding this application to the Board and answered questions regarding the property address (Street/Avenue) and windows.

MOTION: Mr. DeCraemer moved to table application 20-19 until the next meeting.
SECOND: Mr. Gaffer **MOTION PASSED: UNANIMOUSLY**

Agenda Item 6.

Approval of the Minutes of the February 5, 2020 Meeting.

MOTION: Mr. Davis moved to approve the minutes of the February 5, 2020 meeting.
SECOND: Mr. DeCraemer **MOTION PASSED: UNANIMOUSLY**

Agenda Item 7.

Discussion regarding the return of paper copies (packets to Board members).

- We require applicants to provide all 9 copies, but that is not always the case. We also let them know that we can print the copies for them at a cost of .25cents a page. The applicants do not always comply. This takes too much staff time and paper to do so.
- We can start putting the copies together that I have with an agenda and have them ready for the Board if they so choose.
- The Board needs to make a determination on whether we can deny the acceptance of incomplete packets to include the nine (9) copies even if mailed.

The Board will let staff know if they want a paper copy.
Staff will ask for nine (9) copies from the applicant.

Agenda Item 8.

Update on the Green Wind Screens at St. Patrick's Church.

- Letter sent on 2/18/2020 requesting that the green screen be removed.
- Email received in response on 2/21/2020 from Bisbee Vogue Inc. (Email / Picture attached to agenda).

The Board would like for a Design Review Board Application to be filled out and in the meantime that the wind screens be removed.

Agenda Item 9.

Discussion regarding member comments for the design guidelines and other updates for DRB Ordinance/ Guidelines.

Eric Vondy, SHPO Comments: One of the tools we're finding that commissions and the public find helpful is to create a two column list. This is one a single sheet of paper and one column is titled something like Easier to Approve and the other Harder to Approve. These are not scorecards or anything but rather a simple guide to the design guidelines. Off the top of my head the Easier to Approve column would have something like: Similar scale and massing to nearby properties.

Across from it in the Harder to Approve column is: Different scale and massing to nearby properties. Another example could be: Maintains original exterior material vs Replaces original exterior material (e.g with stucco, siding, etc...). Or Addition differentiated from historic property vs Addition indistinguishable from historic property. You could even create several of these if you'd like - for infill, for additions, for window replacement,

etc... But this way it takes some of perceived arbitrariness away from a DRB decision and is in language most anyone can understand.

They will have more comments forthcoming regarding our DRB Guidelines.

Mr. Gaffer will turn in his comments to staff.

- **Donna Pulling spoke regarding the historical survey on the website.**

Agenda Item 10.

Discussion regarding the Zoning Code

-Attached are all the codes that are in the Design Review Board Guidelines.

Board would like the time frame be very clear for turning in applications.

Agenda Item 11.

Discussion regarding creating awareness.

Staff Comments

- Administrative Approval was given by Theresa Coleman, City Manager on 2/14/2020 for DRB Application 20-17; 29 Main Street, Contributing – Bisbee Commercial Historic District: Addition of two skylights on the north side of the sloping metal roof on the north side of the existing building.
- Administrative Approval was given by Theresa Coleman, City Manager on 2/10/2020 Application 20-15; 45 Shearer Avenue Bi-130 Contributing- Replace porch covers as described. **The Board would like to see these in the future.**
- Administrative Approval was given by Theresa Coleman, City Manager on 2/4/2020 Application 20-14; 13 A Maxfield (134 Mansfield Avenue) Bi-87 Contributing- Reinforce existing stone/ concrete retaining wall to prevent erosion.

FUTURE AGENDA ITEM SUGGESTIONS (Board members may suggest topics for future meeting agendas, but Board will not here discuss, deliberate or take any action on these topics.)

- **Guidelines discussion – May not be at the next meeting**

Adjournment: 7:29PM

MOTION: Mr. Davis moved to adjourn

SECOND: Mr. Lepley

MOTION PASSED: UNANIMOUSLY